

Evaluation of Hybrid Learning Programs in Higher Education: A Systematic Literature Review Approach

Faisal Fahriansyah¹, Ketut Agustini², Suradika³, Anak Agung Adi Wirrya Putra^{4*}

¹ Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha, Kabupaten Buleleng, Provinsi Bali, Indonesia.

² Universitas Teknologi Muhammadiyah, Kota Jakarta Selatan, Daerah Khusus Ibukota Jakarta, Indonesia.

^{3,4*} Universitas Pendidikan Nasional, Kota Denpasar, Provinsi Bali, Indonesia.

article info

Article history:

Received 14 May 2025

Received in revised form

20 October 2025

Accepted 20 November 2025

Available online April 2026.

Keywords:

Literature Review; Evaluation of Hybrid Learning;

Education.

Kata Kunci:

Tinjauan Pustaka; Evaluasi

Pembelajaran Hibrida;

Pendidikan.

abstract

This a This evaluation is expected to provide strategic advice on how to develop policies and learning practices in universities to maximize the benefits of hybrid learning and improve the quality of education. The aim of this study is to evaluate the effectiveness of hybrid programs that combine face-to-face and online methods. This research method uses literature review research. Effective learning systems can be applied in universities, the results of a literature review of several articles. Over the past four years, the hybrid model has developed and gained positive values from students. Universities use technology to meet the needs and learning styles of students.

abstrak

Evaluasi ini diharapkan dapat memberikan saran strategis tentang cara mengembangkan kebijakan dan praktik pembelajaran di perguruan tinggi untuk memaksimalkan manfaat dari pembelajaran hybrid dan meningkatkan kualitas Pendidikan. Tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah untuk mengevaluasi efektivitas program hybrid yang menggabungkan metode tatap muka dan daring. Metode penelitian ini menggunakan penelitian literature review. Sistem pembelajaran efektif dapat diterapkan di perguruan tinggi, hasil review literature beberapa artikel. Selama empat tahun terakhir, model hybrid telah berkembang dan mendapatkan nilai positif dari mahasiswa. Universitas menggunakan teknologi untuk memenuhi kebutuhan dan gaya belajar mahasiswa.

Corresponding Author. Email: faisalrahman0605@gmail.com ^{1}.

1. Introduction

The world of higher education has undergone many changes due to the advancement of information and communication technology. One example is the hybrid learning model, which combines face-to-face learning with online learning, which provides greater flexibility and accessibility for students. However, even though this model has great potential, hybrid learning also presents challenges and problems. The hybrid learning model, which combines face-to-face and online learning methods, has been applied in various educational institutions around the world. Although well received in many cases, the implementation still faces a number of technical and pedagogical challenges that need to be overcome. Facts show that although digital technology has provided flexibility in the learning process, there are still significant obstacles in terms of infrastructure readiness, teaching skills, and student involvement in hybrid learning settings. This becomes more relevant considering the COVID-19 pandemic that accelerates the adoption of hybrid learning in various education sectors.

However, it shows that the results obtained from the implementation of this model still vary, depending on how this method is applied and how the adaptation is carried out by both teachers and students. In addition, according to Khoerudin *et al.* (2024) shows that although hybrid learning has great potential to improve the quality of education, challenges such as the digital divide and the readiness of educators in adopting technology are still the main obstacles. Therefore, a thorough evaluation of the implementation of hybrid learning in educational institutions is very important to identify the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats of this learning model. According to Gultom *et al.* (2023) emphasized the importance of effective learning management in the implementation of hybrid learning. Good management can increase students' motivation to learn, cognitive skills, communication, discipline, connection, mathematical representation, and independence.

However, challenges such as managing study schedules and dependence on devices and networks can hinder learning if not done with proper management. Therefore, it is important to conduct a systematic evaluation of the hybrid learning program in universities to get a comprehensive picture of the implementation of this model. This evaluation is expected to provide strategic advice on how to develop learning policies and practices in universities to maximize the benefits of hybrid learning and improve the quality of education. The aim of this study is to evaluate the effectiveness of hybrid programs that combine face-to-face and online methods. This research aims to understand students' perceptions of hybrid learning experiences, as well as identify the challenges and obstacles faced during the implementation of this model. In addition, this research also aims to assess the effectiveness of teaching methods used in hybrid models, including the use of technology and the quality of teaching materials delivered.

2. Research Methodology

This research method uses literature review research. According to Creswell (2017) in Helsa., *et al.* (2023) searching, selecting, weighing and reading literature is the first job in any research project. Literature review does not only mean reading literature, but rather an in-depth and critical evaluation of previous research on a topic. The method of reviewing literature is carried out by searching and collecting literature studies with the keyword "evaluation of hybrid learning programs in universities". There are inclusion and exclusion criteria to choose articles in this study (see table 1) 200 articles found by researchers through 200 publish or perish software according to keywords, then as many as 40 articles were screened. Obtained 9 full text articles carried out as a feasibility assessment. In the end there are 9 articles that are literature. Articles are collected and arranged in table 2 which contains the author, results and the hybrid learning evaluation process.

Table 1. Criteria for inclusion and exclusion of selected articles

Criteria	Inclusion	Exclusion
Type	Indexed journal or conference	Journal is not indexed
Title	Mentioned "evaluation of hybrid learning programs in universities"	Not mentioned
Language	Indonesia	Non-Indonesian
Time	2022-2025	Less tha year 2022
State	Indonesia	Non-Indonesian
Topic	Evaluation of hybrid learning programs in universities	Other topics
Sampele	Collage Students	Not a student

3. Results and Discussion

Hasil

To identify several articles that explain the evaluation of hybrid learning in universities, a literature review was conducted. This research is focused on student

learning such as cognitive skills, thinking skills, applications used in hybrid learning, and the learning process in hybrid learning. In table 2, the results of the analysis of articles that become reference articles in identifying the evaluation of hybrid learning in universities are described.

Table 2. Results of Analysis of Selected Articles

No	Author	Result	Hybrid Learning Process
1	Aman, Risky Setiawan, Lantip Diat Prasoj, & Kunal Mehta (2021) : Evaluation of hybrid learning in college using CIPP Model	The results of the hybrid learning evaluation showed that the value of context, input, process, and product aspects was in the "excellent" category, with a total average score of 3.05.	Obstacles or obstacles in the implementation of hybrid learning include the heterogeneity of the origin of students' residences, causing the emergence of internet network signal problems. Meanwhile, the obstacle for lecturers is that not all lecturers have technology and media skills in the implementation of hybrid learning.
2	Maimunah, & Nurmala Dewi Qadarsih (2024) : The Effectiveness of the Application of Hybrid Learning on Learning Outcomes in Linear and Matrix Algebra Courses	The results showed that the application of hybrid learning in linear algebra and matrix courses was well received by students. Hybrid learning has a positive impact on the learning process and can simultaneously improve students' learning outcomes, communication skills, discipline, and learning independence.	The implementation of hybrid learning in linear algebra and matrix courses shows that learning can run quite well. Some of the problems faced by students include the limited number of internet quotas, signal instability, less supportive devices, and weather factors that also add to the problems in hybrid learning.
3	Yusniar, Ismail, & Rahmatullah (2024): Evaluation of the Hybrid Learning Model in Islamic Religious Education Subjects	The results of the implementation of the Hybrid learning model obtained a score of 93.75% with very good criteria.	The results of the implementation of the Hybrid learning model in Class XII MIPA 1 SMAN 10 Sinjai based on the assessment obtained a score of 93.75% with very good criteria. This can be seen from the implementation of

			the Hybrid learning model according to its syntax, starting from; Prepare me, which is introducing learning objectives to students according to KD and GPA.
4	Haryanto Tanuwijaya (2022): Evaluation of the Success Level of the Implementation of Hybrid Learning Applications in Higher Education Using the DeLone and McLean Models	The results of the study showed that the success rate of the implementation of hybrid learning applications in PTSK was considered good, shown by good scores on all six factors in the model. However, improvements are needed to the Service Quality factor to increase User Satisfaction, and the Use factor so that users feel the Net Benefit to the maximum.	hybrid learning applied at PTSK has a good success rate with a Net Benefit value of 3,489. The success of this application is due to students who feel satisfied (User Satisfaction) because the hybrid learning application helps a lot in the online learning process. This user satisfaction is influenced by complete, relevant and up-to-date information.
5	Vanda Kalista Dewi & Mukti Ratna Dewi (2022) : Evaluation of Satisfaction with the Implementation of Hybrid Learning at the Sepuluh Nopember Institute of Technology	Research Results The level of student satisfaction with the implementation of hybrid offline is very satisfied, while in hybrid online only satisfaction is balanced by positive sentiment in the implementation of hybrid offline more than hybrid online.	Offline hybrid lectures received more positive sentiment than negative sentiment, which was 37.2%, while online hybrid lectures received more negative sentiments than positive sentiments at 47.73%.
6	Junias Robert Gultom, Dadan Sunandar, & Medy Desma Fatwar (2022): Hybrid Learning Model Learning as a Learning System Optimization Strategy in the Covid-19 Pandemic Era in Universities in Jakarta	The results of the study show that effective learning after the covid 19 pandemic is hybrid learning (46.4%), hybrid learning was chosen as the most suitable learning because it can cover the shortcomings of online and offline learning.	Hybrid learning requires special methods related to the delivery of blended learning to improve the quality of learning and the role of universities in the implementation and delivery of materials, so that with the mixed learning method the material delivered can be comprehensively understood by students.
7	Aniek Suryanti Kusuma, I Gede Ratnaya, & I Made Candiasa (2022): Evaluation of Hybrid Learning in Instiki Educational Institutions with a Discrepancy Evaluation Model.	The results of the study found that the effectiveness of the hybrid learning program at INSTIKI Denpasar institution was assessed well with an overview of the design stage, the installation stage, the on-campus stage that meets eighty percent of government aspects, and the goal of phase four was achieved so that the score was good.	In the comparison phase with other programs, each program helps but supports the others. Four gaps were found in the program: lack of parental involvement in the classroom and cessation of lecturer-to-lecturer activities. There is no combination of news and accompanying readings, caregiver participation in the program. Researchers suggest continuing this program with improvements.

8	<p>Syavira Salsabilah Putri Nola Pratiwi, Rahma Nova Handayani, Asmat Burhan, & Amin Santoso (2024): Students' Perceptions and Interests in the Hybrid Learning-Based Learning Process at the Nursing Anesthesiology Study Program, Universitas Harapan Bangsa</p>	<p>The results of the study found that students with high interest have a positive perception of the hybrid learning-based learning process.</p>	<p>Researchers say this happens because the high interest of students shows that there is a desire and attention that is more focused from students to follow the learning process well, so that this makes students have a positive perception of the learning process based on hybrid learning.</p>
9	<p>Afif Rahman Riyanda, Tia Agnesa, Alsyabri Wira, Ambiyar, Sukardi Umar, & Uswatul Hakim (2022): Hybrid Learning: Alternative Learning Models During the Covid-19 Pandemic</p>	<p>The selection of the hybrid learning learning model is based on the fact that students have difficulty communicating face-to-face during the pandemic, when in fact they can communicate simultaneously (synchronous) and at different times (asynchronous).</p>	<p>Learning is carried out face-to-face, so the face-to-face learning process is best by applying the hybrid learning model. This means that if educators tend to use learning methods that encourage students to actively search, find, and develop their own learning outcomes, the online learning model is the choice. However, in the learning process, it is inseparable from the guidance provided by educators</p>

Based on table 2, this finding shows that hybrid learning has a positive impact on the learning process in universities. The impact can simultaneously improve student learning outcomes such as motivation, cognitive skills, communication skills, discipline, connection, mathematical representation and student learning independence. Articles (1), (2) and (3) show that the results of the hybrid learning evaluation show that the value of the context, input, process, and product aspects are included in the "very good" category, which is with a total average score of 3.05 and can be well accepted by students. Hybrid learning has a positive impact on the learning process and can simultaneously improve learning outcomes, communication skills, discipline, and student learning independence. But there are still obstacles in the implementation of hybrid learning, including the heterogeneity of the origin of the student's residence, causing the emergence of internet network signal obstacles. While the problem of lecturers is that not all lecturers have technology and media skills in the implementation of hybrid

learning and some problems faced by students include the limited amount of internet quota, signal instability, poor supporting devices, and weather factors. Based on table 2, information was obtained that in supporting hybrid learning, several media can be used, Article (4) explains that hybrid learning needs an application or media to support the hybrid learning program with the results that have been researched using media is that the application of hybrid learning applications in PTSK is considered good, shown with good grades in all six factors in the model. But there are still obstacles to hybrid learning by using media, need to improve the Service Quality factor to increase User Satisfaction, and the Use factor so that users can experience the Net Benefit to the maximum. Student response in using media in hybrid learning program the success of this application is due to students who feel satisfied (User Satisfaction) because the hybrid learning application helps a lot in the online learning process. This user satisfaction is influenced by complete, relevant and up-to-date information. Articles (5) and (8) explain that there is a comparison

according to students for the level of satisfaction between online-based and offline hybrid learning is overall very satisfied, while in hybrid online only satisfaction is balanced by positive sentiment on the implementation of offline hybrid more than hybrid online, students with high interest have a positive perception of the hybrid learning process based on hybrid learning. Article (6) hybrid learning was chosen as the most suitable learning because it can cover the shortcomings of online and offline learning. Student interest shows that there is a desire and more focused attention from students to follow the learning process well, so that this makes students have a positive perception of the hybrid learning-based learning process. Furthermore, Articles (7) and (9) explain the effectiveness of the hybrid learning program at the INSTIKI Denpasar institution is considered good with a description of the design stage, the installation stage, the on-campus stage that meets eighty percent of the government aspects, and the goal of stage four is achieved so that the score is good. The selection of the hybrid learning model is based on the fact that students have difficulty communicating face-to-face during the pandemic, even though in reality they can communicate simultaneously (synchronously) and at different times (asynchronous).

Because learning is done face to face, the hybrid learning model is the best. In other words, the online learning model is the best choice for educators who tend to use a learning approach that encourages students to actively seek, discover, and develop their own knowledge. However, the learning process cannot be separated from the teacher's supervision. Effective learning systems can be applied in universities, the results of a literature review of several articles. Over the past four years, the hybrid model has developed and gained positive values from students. Universities use technology to meet the needs and learning styles of students. Learning management systems to adaptive learning software and video conferencing have changed the way students learn. For more than four years, many colleges have incorporated distance learning and technology into their curriculum. Hybrid model is used to integrate technology in learning. Hybrid learning is a type of blended learning where students learn directly and through the internet

simultaneously. This type of learning is more focused on combining a physical learning environment with a virtual learning environment. Hybrid learning, which relies on technology to provide online learning, is a major drawback. For digital platforms and online assets to be successful, they must be reliable, easy to use, and up-to-date. Therefore, it is very important to take action to ensure that good technology is available and good technical assistance is available.

Discussion

The findings from this literature review indicate that the hybrid learning model positively influences various aspects of higher education, particularly in enhancing student motivation, cognitive skills, communication, discipline, and independence. This aligns with the study by Aman *et al.* (2021), which reported that evaluations of context, input, process, and product aspects of hybrid learning implementation fall within a very good category, reflecting strong student acceptance. Similarly, Maimunah and Qadarsih (2024) found that applying hybrid learning in Linear Algebra and Matrix courses not only improves academic outcomes but also strengthens communication and discipline among students. Nevertheless, challenges such as uneven internet access and limited technological proficiency among lecturers, highlighted by Aman *et al.* (2021) and Khoerudin *et al.* (2024), remain significant barriers that must be addressed to optimize the effectiveness of hybrid learning. Furthermore, Haryanto Tanuwijaya (2022) emphasized that the success of hybrid learning applications heavily depends on service quality and user satisfaction, underscoring the necessity of reliable technological infrastructure and adequate technical support to maximize the benefits of online learning components. Dewi and Dewi (2022) also noted that students tend to express greater satisfaction with hybrid learning conducted face-to-face compared to fully online formats, indicating the importance of balancing direct interaction with technology use in the learning process. Gultom *et al.* (2023) support these findings by identifying hybrid learning as an effective strategy to optimize learning systems in the post-COVID-19 era, as it addresses the limitations inherent in both fully online and face-to-face learning modes. In this context, the active role of instructors in guiding and managing hybrid learning is critical, as highlighted by Riyanda *et al.* (2022), who

stress that teacher supervision remains essential to ensure students' meaningful engagement throughout the learning process. Overall, this review underscores that hybrid learning offers a flexible approach that caters to the diverse needs of students and institutions. However, its success largely depends on technological readiness, instructor competence, and supportive policies. Continuous evaluation and enhancement of both technical and pedagogical aspects are therefore imperative to ensure the model delivers optimal and sustainable educational outcomes.

4. Conclusion

Hybrid learning improves student motivation, cognitive skills, communication skills, discipline, connections, service quality, support, and mathematical reasoning. However, hybrid learning also faces challenges such as lack of technology and media in the learning process, unstable internet connections, and lack of supporting factors. To achieve net benefits from the implementation of hybrid learning, the media must support the program, improve the quality of services to increase user satisfaction, and increase usage. Factors such as learning design, institutions, government support, and teacher focus affect the quality of hybrid learning. Over the past four years, the hybrid learning model has developed and is widely used in educational institutions. This model uses technology to meet the requirements of students and improve their learning experience. Hybrid learning has increased discipline, motivation, communication skills, and student motivation. This innovation has changed the way and time of learning from system management to student involvement.

5. References

- Aman, A., Setiawan, R., Prasojo, D. L., & Mehta, K. (2021). Evaluation of hybrid learning in college using CIPP model. *Jurnal Penelitian dan Evaluasi Pendidikan*, 25(2), 218–231. <https://doi.org/10.21831/pep.v25i2.46348>.
- Bozkurt, A. (2022). A retro perspective on blended/hybrid learning: Systematic review, mapping and visualization of the scholarly landscape. *Journal of Interactive Media in Education*, 2022(1).
- Dewi, K. V., & Dewi, R. M. (2022). Evaluasi kepuasan pelaksanaan hybrid learning di Institut Teknologi Sepuluh Nopember. *Seminar Nasional Official Statistics*, 1239–1248. <https://doi.org/1473-ArticleText-7855-1-10-20221101>.
- Garcia, V. F. (2023). *Systematic literature review of 200 quality assurance and quality matters research articles pertaining to online and hybrid learning in higher education* (Master's thesis, California State University, Sacramento).
- Gudoniene, D., Staneviciene, E., Huet, I., Dickel, J., Dieng, D., Degroote, J., ... & Casanova, D. (2025). Hybrid teaching and learning in higher education: A systematic literature review. *Sustainability*, 17(2), 756.
- Gultom, R. J., Sundara, D., & Fatwara, D. M. (2022). Pembelajaran hybrid learning model sebagai strategi optimalisasi sistem pembelajaran di era pandemi Covid-19 pada perguruan tinggi di Jakarta. *Mediastima*, 28(01), 12–22. <https://doi.org/10.55122/mediastima.v28i1.385>.
- Helsa, Y., Marasabessy, R., Junaedi, D., & Turmudi. (2023). Penerapan hybrid learning di perguruan tinggi Indonesia: Literatur review. *Jurnal Cendekia: Jurnal Pendidikan Matematika*, 7(1), 139–162. <https://doi.org/10.31004/cendekia.v7i1.1910>.
- Kusuma, S. A., Ratnaya, G. I., & Candiasa, M. I. (2022). Evaluasi pembelajaran hybrid pada institusi pendidikan INSTIKI dengan discrepancy evaluation model. *Jurnal Penjamin Mutu*, 8(2), 213–223.
- Maimunah, & Qadarsih, D. N. (2024). Efektivitas penerapan pembelajaran hybrid terhadap hasil belajar pada mata kuliah aljabar linier dan

- matrik. *Jurnal Pendidikan Tambusai*, 8(2), 30810–30816.
- Pratiwi, N. P. S. S., Handayani, N. R., Burhan, A., & Susanto, A. (2024). Persepsi dan minat mahasiswa dalam proses pembelajaran berbasis hybrid learning di program studi keperawatan anestesiologi Universitas Harapan Bangsa. *Jurnal Ilmiah Wahana Pendidikan*, 10(9), 662–673. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.11183278>.
- Raes, A., Detienne, L., Windey, I., & Depaepe, F. (2020). A systematic literature review on synchronous hybrid learning: gaps identified. *Learning environments research*, 23(3), 269-290.
- Riyanda, R. A., Agnesa, T., Wira, A., Ambiyar, Umar, S., & Hakim, U. (2022). Hybrid learning: Alternatif model pembelajaran di masa pandemi Covid-19. *Jurnal Basicedu*, 6(3), 4461–4469. <https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v6i3.2794>.
- Tanuwijaya, H. (2022). Evaluasi tingkat kesuksesan penerapan aplikasi hybrid learning perguruan tinggi menggunakan model DeLone dan McLean. *Jurnal Ilmiah Teknik Informatika dan Sistem Informasi*, 11(2), 303–314.
- Wood, H. C., Detyna, M., & Dommett, E. J. (2025). Assessing and understanding educators' experiences of synchronous hybrid learning in universities: A systematic review. *Education Sciences*, 15(8), 987.
- Yusniar, Ismail, & Rahmatullah. (2024). Evaluasi model pembelajaran hybrid learning pada mata pelajaran pendidikan agama Islam. *Jurnal Al-Ilmi*, 4(2), 26–27.